
Las Casas and His Amerindian Nurse: Tropes of Lactation in the French Colonial Imaginary (c.1770–1815)

Jutta Gisela Sperling

At the *Salon* of 1808, Louis Hersent (1777–1860) exhibited one of his latest paintings representing colonial subject matters, entitled *Las Casas Cured by Savages* (Figure 1).¹ Inspired by Jean-François Marmontel's pre-revolutionary bestseller *Les Incas* (1777), it shows a bedridden Bartolomé de las Casas (1484–1566) – famous missionary, eyewitness and critic of the Spanish genocide in the New World – suckling milk from the gorgeous bosom of a young Amerindian woman. Next to her, and behind Las Casas, stands Henri, the nurse's husband, characterised by his noble 'Greek' profile, feathery headgear, snake tattoo and native attire, including a pouch of arrows on his back.² The young woman, herself of equally perfect classical features, embraces her husband with one arm and employs the other to offer her breast to the patient. In a wall niche behind her, facing the viewer, stands a statue of the Virgin Mary with the infant Jesus. To the left, behind the 'noble savage', hangs a small wooden cross. The entire scene is wonderfully quiet and intimate. A sole candle illuminates the room, in addition to the votive light burning in front of the Virgin Mary, but in reality the light is pouring from the young woman's naked white arm and bosom. On a small table in front of the bed lies a thick book, probably Holy Scripture, next to a cup and pitcher. On an adjacent stool there is fruit, brought to Las Casas by his visitors.

Hersent's painting was recommended by Charles Paul Landon (1760–1826) in his *Annales du Musée et de l'Ecole moderne des beaux-arts* (1808) as a 'well-executed' painting on a 'well-known' subject, referring to Marmontel's best-selling novel *Les Incas* of some thirty years earlier, in which Bartolomé de las Casas appears as a central character.³ This work of historical fiction, loosely based on Las Casas's *Brief Account of the Destruction of the Indies* (first Spanish edition 1552), Incan author Garcilaso de la Vega's *Royal Commentaries of Peru* (first Spanish edition 1609), Mme de Graffigny's *Letters from a Peruvian Woman* (first French edition 1747) and Charles-Marie de Condamine's *Journal of a Journey by Order of the King to the Equator* (first French edition 1751), among others, is a melodramatic retelling of the Spanish conquest of Central and South America, in which a mixture of historical and fictional characters act out the inevitability of the Incas' defeat.⁴ Pizarro is cast as an 'astounding man', 'liberal, generous, and sensible' but unable to prevent his general,



Figure 1: Louis Hersent, *Las Casas Cured by Savages* (1808). Private collection, US.

Valverde, from murdering their ally, the Incan king Ataliba (Atahualpa) – an act of treason that precipitates a series of massacres during which both Atahualpa’s and his enemy half-brother Guascar’s armies are wiped out.⁵ Descriptions of Incan rites and practices – based on Vega’s *Royal Commentaries* – are woven into this narrative, whose main plot is propelled by a romance between Alonzo, a young Spanish conquistador gone native and Enlightenment philosopher of law *avant la lettre*, and Cora, an Incan virgin priestess. In the end, everybody will have died, but not before Marmontel gives a utopian outlook on Euro-American relations in a pivotal scene, in which an ailing Las Casas explains to Pizarro how colonial exploitation should have been based on free trade instead of violence. He then proceeds to suckle milk from the breast of a Central American chieftain’s wife, offered to him as a lifesaving remedy in exchange for his ‘gift’ of conversion, as if to illustrate and enact the benefits of reciprocity in a liberal economy.⁶ Despite the fact that Marmontel’s novel has been analysed extensively, most scholars have focused on Alonzo’s and Cora’s cross-racial love story, neglecting to comment on this white ‘father’s’ consumption of his Indian ‘daughter’s’ healing and rejuvenating body fluids.⁷

Appealing primarily to a female audience by aiming to arouse empathy, the novel was an instant hit. Pirated the same year it came out, it was immediately translated into other European languages and reprinted numerous times in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.⁸ Plays and operas in German, English, Russian, Spanish and Italian emerged as variations on the novel’s tragic love story between Alonzo and



Figure 2: Jean-Michel Moreau the Younger, *The Illness of Las Casas*, engraving (1777). Marmontel, *Les Incas*, vol. 2 (Paris, 1777), p. 217. Bibliothèque nationale, Paris.

Cora.⁹ Especially in early nineteenth-century Latin America, Marmontel's novel and its various permutations were much appreciated.¹⁰

The first authorised edition of *Les Incas*, illustrated with engravings by Jean-Michel Moreau the Younger (1741–1814), contained a depiction of the theme that inspired Hersent (Figure 2). Here, the native princess-nurse occupies centre stage;

naked except for a feathery skirt and crown, she stands erect in front of Las Casas, index and middle fingers of her left hand in the typical V-hold with which nurses were (and still are) supposed to squeeze their nipple and offer their breast. This scene is more agitated, more crowded and less mystical than Hersent's version. Spanish conquistadors, paying Las Casas a sick visit, watch in astonishment as their spiritual leader is about to be 'treated' by the wife of their enemy. Henri urges Las Casas on, full of impatience, as Pizarro, somewhat marginally seated in the shadowy right-hand corner, observes the tender scene. Gonsalvo Davila – son of a ruthless conquistador but now reformed under Las Casas's influence and separated from his tyrannical father – is also present, as well as a non-identified sixth person. As in Hersent's painting, the young woman's white skin illuminates the room.

Marmontel's, Moreau's and Hersent's envisioning of Las Casas as the grateful recipient of a native mother's healing milk had the purpose of recasting colonial relationships as a fantasy about the peaceful – if uneven – exchange of life-giving, transformative resources, in which former cannibals had become charitable food.¹¹ The image of the breastfeeding Las Casas, not only symbolising America's voluntary sharing of natural resources in exchange for a benevolent and paternalistic introduction to Christianity, but also alluding to the possibility of a power reversal between the New World and the Old – however fleeting – was a contrast to the many accounts of bloodshed and rape that since the early sixteenth century were known to have characterised the Spanish project of 'discovery'.¹² The lactation scene played on longstanding myths and metaphors of the New World as a fertile virgin land, ready for consumption by European adventurers, and on equally sedimented views of native Americans as noble savages and innocent victims of Spanish conquistadors.¹³ The specific rendering of this set of tropes in Marmontel's novel and Hersent's painting deserves closer scrutiny, however, as Las Casas's milk relationship with the Indian princess not only presented a somewhat idiosyncratic commentary on and alternative to previous models of colonial exploitation, but expressed the need for a moral and institutional reform of French patriarchy. Appropriating the Baroque iconography of the so-called Roman Charity – for his presentation of Las Casas derived from the ancient story of Pero, the pious daughter who breastfeeds her father, Cimon, sentenced to death by starvation for a capital crime – Marmontel politicises his colonial romance as a discussion about the possibility of transforming *ancien régime* power structures.¹⁴ After all, Pero's heroic, self-effacing and abject sacrifice for the sake of her guilty father not only restores his health but redeems him morally – an ambiguous outcome of an ancient anecdote about filial piety and the assumed reciprocity of father–daughter relations in imperial Rome. Marmontel thus made a fairly unique contribution to the proliferation of the many pre- and post-revolutionary 'family romances' analysed by Lynn Hunt, presenting a political problem as a riddle about kinship, filiation, gender and reproduction.¹⁵

Marmontel's image of a 'just' white man's acceptance of an Amerindian woman's magic milk-offer envisions a new kind of *métissage*, a form of cross-racial kinship grounded in milk, care and adoption rather than blood, rape and procreation. It proposes to re-imagine the colonial project as a traditionally gendered but pacified version of Euro-American symbiosis, within which Europe would be granted guilt-free, unlimited access to America's natural resources in exchange for a truly charitable and enlightened – that is, French – form of Catholicism. This vision resonated powerfully with Enlightenment audiences despite – or perhaps because of – the author's failure

to consider the triangular nature of Atlantic trade relations. *Les Incas* thus differs from more radical critiques of colonisation, such as those by Raynal and Diderot, and sits uneasily in the vicinity of the abolitionist and anti-abolitionist treatises to which Marmontel refuses to pay attention.¹⁶

In the Napoleonic era, Hersent's reflection on Marmontel's Enlightenment ideal of Euro-American empathy, affiliation and paternalistic symbiosis appears nostalgic and curiously anachronistic. At a time when the monarchy had been destroyed and reinvented, slavery abolished and reinstated, and a series of neocolonial, imperial campaigns won and lost, other contemporary writers and painters responded to Marmontel's trope of cross-Atlantic charitable milk-exchange by pointing to its inherent contradictions. François-René Chateaubriand, Heinrich von Kleist, Anne-Louis Girodet and Eugene Delacroix, among others, infused the theme with incestuous, necrophilic or violent associations, mourning both the loss of the New World as a utopian space and the loss of pre-revolutionary innocence in a complicated process of cross-identification.

This article thus explores how Marmontel's proposal for a 'soft' model of colonial exploitation was received by Enlightenment audiences, and how the image of the breastfeeding Las Casas resonated with both pre- and post-revolutionary writers' and artists' use of lactation imagery in their discussions of paternal authority, modes of mothering, racial mixing and colonial exploitation.¹⁷ For this purpose, I will briefly discuss the use of breast milk for therapeutic purposes in early modern medicine; trace the popularity of iconographies of lactation in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century art; point to *métissage* as a governing trope of both plot and style in Marmontel's novel; discuss nursing in all its varieties – maternal, commercial and charitable – as a supposedly asexual practice; mention the revolutionary requirement of breastfeeding to signify immediacy and transparency; situate Hersent's classicising painting among Romantic colonial narratives and art works; and conclude with an outlook on father–daughter incest and other forms of miscegenation as yet another failed 'family romance' of the French Revolution.¹⁸

Marmontel's and Hersent's depictions of Las Casas's milk cure played on ancient recommendations of breast milk as a cure for eye disease, gout, tuberculosis and fatigue, primarily in old men.¹⁹ In Diderot and D'Alembert's *Encyclopédie* (1765), breast milk was recommended as a highly efficient remedy against consumption in men, provided that its rather tempting mode of presentation did not lead to sexual arousal.²⁰ In seventeenth- and eighteenth-century treatises on the treatment of gout – an illness believed to be the result of a man's lifelong indulgence in fatty foods, wine and sex – the consumption of large quantities of milk was praised as a highly efficient antidote in that it led towards the curative and punitive regression into an infant-like state.²¹ While most authors shied away from recommending breast milk openly, instead praising goat or cow milk as a valid substitute, quotes from Pliny the Elder (c.23–79 CE) and Marsilio Ficino (1433–1499) on the medicinal qualities of human milk, as well as veiled references to the wet-nursing business, reveal this implicit association.²² In eighteenth-century Germany, heart disease was treated with breast milk as well. In his autobiography, Gotthelf Greiner (1732–1797), a porcelain manufacturer in Limbach, reports how he decided to follow his physician's advice to drink from his wife's breasts, after the attempt to cure his *Wassersucht* by ingesting human fat – extracted from the corpse of a woman executed for infanticide – failed.²³ Initially terrified at the thought,

he overcame his feelings of disgust and quickly took to the unusual cure. His condition improved markedly after several months of breastfeeding from his wife; once she had weaned her son, he resorted to drinking his cousin's milk, sent to him daily in large cups, until he completely recovered.²⁴

Most medical authors imagined male patients as model recipients of breast milk, but evidence shows that in practice, female patients likewise assumed the passive role in therapeutic milk-exchanges. Elisabeth Henriette von Hessen-Kassel, Erbprinzessin of Brandenburg (1661–1683), drank milk from a wet nurse until she completely recovered from an unspecified but near-fatal illness.²⁵ Madame de Roland (1754–1793), wife of future minister of the interior Jean-Marie Roland de la Platière (1734–1793), engaged a *téteuse* (female breast-sucker) to reactivate her milk flow, lost due to an infection of the breast a few weeks after giving birth to her daughter, Eudore.²⁶ Anxious to resume her primary duty as a citizen and mother, Mme de Roland had herself sucked several times daily by a woman from the countryside.²⁷ Despite the intimate nature of this relationship, the *téteuse* remained unnamed in the many letters Mme de Roland wrote to her husband about the progress of her recovery.²⁸ Mme de Roland insisted on prolonging the treatment even after her milk flow had started again.²⁹ Hesitantly, she finally dismissed her *téteuse* on 11 January 1782, but not before compensating her handsomely. To her husband, she wrote how 'content' both of them had emerged from the relationship.³⁰ Adult breastfeeding practices – whether passive or active, all female or cross-gendered – were thus an integral element of physicians' therapeutic repertoire until at least the late eighteenth century.

Perhaps more importantly, however, the image of Las Casas and his wet nurse was presented as a variation on the theme of Roman Charity, a popular iconography inspired by an anecdote in Valerius Maximus's *Memorable Doings and Sayings* (c.30 CE), described briefly above.³¹ According to this story, told as ekphrasis, a young Greek woman, Pero, secretly nursed her old father, Myko (later referred to as Cimon) – a citizen of Athens condemned to death by starvation – in a dungeon-like prison.³² Emphasising the spectacular, incestuous and possibly erotic quality of the father–daughter lactation, Maximus leaves the reader free to speculate about the moral implications of this event. Does it portray an ailing father, guilty of a heinous crime, in utter dependence on his daughter's sense of piety, or does it stress a father's undue exploitation of his daughter's body fluids, destined for her own and another man's child? Does it envision the withering away of patriarchy, or does it stress women's sense of duty and submission, which would continue to nourish old men's rule in times of crisis? Whether due to its complex paradoxical connotations or its titillating erotic quality, Maximus's anecdote of Pero and Myko/Cimon gained great notoriety among ancient audiences, writers and – above all – artists.³³ While Renaissance painters only hesitatingly experimented with the motif, Baroque artists jumped on the topic once Caravaggio made it presentable, exploiting its obvious erotic content and probing the subversive potential of what Roberto Danese has called second-order incest.³⁴ In France, the motif enjoyed particular popularity in the decades leading up to the revolution.

Pero's nursing of her father resonated with Baroque European audiences not only as a pre-Christian example of female piety and charitable humility, but also as a potentially subversive, imaginary reversal of predominant theories of kinship: instead of a daughter's dependence on her father for protection and dowry payments, it depicts a father's dependence on his daughter's charity; instead of symbolising the transmission

of paternal blood down to future generations, it shows how filial milk ascends the agnatic ladder; instead of arousing manly sexual desire, the breast is portrayed as delivering neo-natal *jouissance*; instead of depicting procreation, the nursing scene emphasises regression.

In appropriating the iconography of Cimon and Pero for his portrayal of the ideal colonial relationship, Marmontel did not fully exploit the subversive potential of his source. Rather than stressing the nurse's life-giving power, he emphasised how Las Casas's modest surrender to his native daughter's care and nourishment symbolised the logic of colonisation as a benevolent father's appropriation of resources, which – in proper Aristotelian fashion – was imagined as always already belonging to the active, form-giving principle of paternity.³⁵ After all, the nurse's sacrifice was couched as the payback for a momentous gift – conversion to Christianity – that she could never even have dreamed of rejecting. In the discursive space of the novel, the obligation of the colonised to pay 'modest' tributes is nowhere disputed.³⁶

The portrayal of Las Casas's nurse as Pero underlines the inevitability of her gift, but the scene also endows her with an awe-inspiring charisma. Her sublime gesture communicates with an entire repertoire of ancient, medieval and early modern representations of lactation, ranging from the iconography of the *Madonna Lactans* to allegorisations of charity as a breastfeeding woman to images of ancient rites of divine affiliation through milk exchange.³⁷

While deviating from Rousseau's maxim of exclusive maternal breastfeeding, Marmontel echoed other writers' romanticised view of rural wet-nursing as a potential source of regeneration for the ills of a weakened urban governing elite. In his famous medical treatise, *Système physique et moral de la femme* (1775), Pierre Roussel praises wet-nursing for its capacity to establish bonds of fosterage between rich, degenerate urbanites and poor but healthy peasant families, exclaiming, 'If I have only one drop of blood that is exempt from corruption flowing through my veins . . . I probably sucked it up with the milk of those [peasant women] who gave it to me'.³⁸ In a variety of plays, the moral virtues of rural youth are emphasised in plots dramatising how milk-brothers compete for the same village girl; and girls raised in the country exhibit the transparency and incorruptible natural charm of which urbanite females were found wanting.³⁹

On the level of style, Marmontel rendered his politico-cultural programme through the fusion and integration of seemingly disparate textual genres. *Les Incas* – a prime example of literary *métissage* in its combining of fact and fiction as well as narrative, poetic and dramatic elements – presents itself as a reassemblage and reinterpretation of well-known events from the history of the conquest.⁴⁰ Its plot is propelled by the unfolding of romantic attachments between native Americans and mixed-race couples amid recurrent bloodshed and battle scenes. Narrative tension is produced by the many obstacles Alonzo has to overcome in his quest for Cora, virgin of the sun. Digressions into anthropological and geographical observations, for which engravings provide visual evidence, enrich this *roman total*.⁴¹ Las Casas's 'cure' marks a utopian moment of reconciliation, of which his affiliation with his native nurse is sign and symbol. Such intimacy among people of antagonistic camps corresponds, on the level of narrative development, to the integration of distinct textual genres and stylistic elements.

More specifically, it is the father–daughter bond that characterises the ideal colonial relationship in *Les Incas*. Initially hesitant to accept Henri's offer to nurse from

his wife, Las Casas yielded readily once she exclaimed, 'Am I not your daughter? Are you not our father?' as if the filial bond between them, however fictive, entitled him to consume this most precious of her body fluids.⁴² 'Too moved to reject her touching plea, too virtuous to blush in surrendering to her, the solitary [Las Casas] received her, with the same innocence with which the favour was offered to him'.⁴³ After his first nursing session, he allowed her to 'never leave his side'. Suckling from this Virgin Mary-like Indian woman of 'divine beauty' and 'ravishing' modesty, Las Casas rapidly recovers. His adoption by a native mother–daughter represents a utopian moment, an instance of forgiving, a longed-for alternative to the bloodbaths that are soon to follow, from which only Las Casas, as if anointed by a magic fluid, would be spared.⁴⁴

Las Casas's rejuvenating cure was thus of multifaceted metaphoric significance in pre-revolutionary debates on how to regenerate an ailing, patriarchal form of government; legitimise the project of colonisation by introducing 'reciprocity' through trade; and combat the 'mercenary' aspects of contemporary infant care in the form of wet-nursing.⁴⁵ More specifically, Las Casas's nursing encounter can be read as a commentary on and alternative to actual blood-related forms of kinship between Europeans and Americans. Marmontel hypothesised a relationship between Old World fathers and New World daughters, characterised by both voluntary, mutual assimilation and an asexual spilling of body fluids. In his novel, milk sharing functions as a trope of non-violent hybridity, spiritual kinship, and anti-authoritarianism – associations evoking the stark contrast between French enlightened proposals for a renewal of colonial bonds based on trade and reciprocity, and the Spanish conquistadors' self-destructive thirst for blood, sex and gold. Actual *métissage* was not favoured by Marmontel, in contrast to Incan author Garcilaso de la Vega, who claimed that 'the best and most esteemed of all those things which were transported into the Indies, were the Spaniards themselves, and the Negroes which are their Slaves and Servants', and to Raynal and Diderot, who speculated whether

perhaps, this mixture may be of advantage, if it be a fact that men, as well as animals, are improved by crossing the breed. It were indeed to be wished, that the various races of mankind were lost in one, that there might be an end of those national antipathies, which only serve to perpetuate the calamities of war, and all the several passions that destroy the human species.⁴⁶

In Diderot's eyes, mixed-race sex and American-style violence might be just what France needed. Pondering the potential for the nation's regeneration, he pronounced, willfully distorting Ovid's account of how Medea 'rejuvenated' her father-in-law: 'A nation can only regenerate itself through a bloodbath. The nation is the old image of Aeson, whom Medea rendered young only by dismembering and boiling him. . . . [The rejuvenation] will take the workings of a long series of revolutions'.⁴⁷

Marmontel sought a different 'solution' to both the budding race question and the problem of French rejuvenation. In contrast both to the Spaniards' self-destructive indulgence in murder, rape and plunder, and to Alonzo's marriage to an ex-virgin of the sun which, despite hopeful beginnings, could not but result in a stillborn son and Cora's death, Henri's wife's milk-offering to a European adult was singled out in Marmontel's narrative. It appears as the only event capable of creating durable bonds between two characters of his novel that would leave their personal integrity and racial identity intact.⁴⁸ Moreover, it sealed a triangular relationship between the nurse, her husband and her adoptive son–father, faintly echoing Aristotelian accounts of generation, which

postulated the active role of male sperm in initialising pregnancies and, by extension, the production of milk.⁴⁹ By creating bonds of milk-kinship between her ‘father’, her recently deceased child, her husband and – in a wider sense – her people, Las Casas’s native nurse did what women were supposed to do in both Old World and New: establish ties between men.⁵⁰

Marmontel’s substitution of cross-racial blood-exchange and procreation with milk exchange and adoptive care as master metaphors for colonial relationships echoed ancient incest taboos associated with breastfeeding.⁵¹ More recent traces of the prohibition on mixing milk and blood can be found in early modern wet-nursing practices. Wet-nursing contracts from Renaissance Florence indicate that fathers of newborn infants paid the husbands of wet nurses for their promise to refrain from sex rather than rewarding the women for their labour of care.⁵² From a medical perspective, breastfeeding was viewed as incompatible with sexual intercourse because the latter was said to ‘spoil’ the milk, independent of the danger of a new pregnancy.⁵³

A similarly antagonistic relationship between adult nursing and sex can be found in Marmontel’s novel as well, underlining the fact that it is not rape this white man is after.⁵⁴ Las Casas’s ‘innocence’ is emphasised throughout the book. He is of ‘simple’ feelings, meaning ‘pure’; he is ‘tender’, ‘compassionate’ and ‘charitable’ – in short, ‘apostolic’.⁵⁵ His innocence not only qualified him to receive his cure and become healed, but was symbolised by his status as a nursling. In contemporary medical treatises on the medicinal use of both human and animal milk, innocence was often couched as a pre-requisite for therapeutic success, sometimes even emphasised as the desired outcome of such a cure. As already mentioned, seventeenth-century recommendations on how to treat gout in old men aimed at reducing a patient’s diet and digestive functions to that of an infant.⁵⁶ Such punitive regression into one’s childhood was to be achieved by drinking fresh milk several times daily, preferably from a cow that was ‘not pregnant’, of ‘middle age’ and of ‘good habit’.⁵⁷ More effective than cow’s milk was, of course, mother’s milk, a ‘fact’ that the majority of gout experts – mostly northern European Protestants with a keen eye on the somatic expressions of sin – refused to admit openly, given their simultaneous polemic against wet-nursing.⁵⁸

As also explicated in Diderot and D’Alembert’s *Encyclopédie*, the success of mother’s milk as a remedy for tuberculosis and other forms of consumption depended on the patient’s childlike ‘passions and affectations of his soul’ – qualities, the authors noted, that were only rarely found among adults. They recommended most urgently that young male patients not be given ‘young’, ‘fresh’ and ‘proper’ nurses, because the sexual desire that was very likely to be aroused could only be harmful to a speedy recovery and even lead to death.⁵⁹ Marmontel’s Las Casas, of course, was exempted from such suspicions; his emotional economy was as ‘childlike’ as could possibly be imagined. At the same time, his reluctant acceptance of the young woman’s breast was couched as the surrender to a daughter’s filial care and love.⁶⁰ His engulfment of New World riches was presented as the gracious, measured acceptance of a native woman’s voluntary offering of her body for non-sexual consumption.

In sixteenth-century imagery, by contrast, America’s pristine virginity and hidden treasures could not but wait to be conquered, even if boundary loss, paranoia and fear of castration accompanied such ego-defying indulgence in excess. Referring to Louis Montrose’s ‘The Work of Gender in the Discourse of Discovery’, Ann McClintock

shows how rape came to be the mode and metaphor of early modern America's economic and sexual exploitation, and how the Spanish explorers' cult of uninhibited male desire to dominate survived in modified fashion until the nineteenth century and beyond in the philosophy and psychology of modern, dialectic, subject-formation.⁶¹ In McClintock's study, psychoanalysis emerges as a profoundly colonial discursive practice of self-‘exploration’ based on the ‘discovery’ of crucial but hidden desires and of (pre-)oedipal childhood traumas of castration and other significant losses. It is seen as a technique of self, functionally and historically tied to the political economy of imperialism.⁶²

French Enlightenment discourse on colonialism and slavery, however, tried to avoid the paradigm of master–slave relations, which would soon define the origins of modern desire. Searching for more ‘human’, ‘egalitarian’ or ‘brotherly’ ways in which the new, female continent could belong to Europe, the rape-and-virgin metaphor – sign and seal of sixteenth-century conquest – was vilified. Criticising the many crimes committed by Spanish colonisers, Marmontel proposes a more peacefully gendered image of belonging, indicating the rejuvenating bliss of non-aggressive consumption and the ennobling reward of constant giving. Indulgence in excess remained a possibility – a mother's milk supply is endless – but only insofar as America's infinite riches were voluntarily sacrificed and decorously accepted. America's breasts were all ‘good’; they would never be withheld. Already Columbus proclaimed to have found in the Dominican Republic the ‘nipple’ of our breast-world.⁶³

Thus, Las Casas's cure was not an irreciprocal, one-sided, infantile form of milk consumption. America was willing, able and prepared to affiliate Las Casas as son and father because he adopted the New World first: Henri and his wife were both Catholics. In this way, Marmontel's colonial reworking of the theme of Roman Charity played on the need for reciprocity while also insisting on Europe's dominance. Pizarro, a peace-loving, enlightened anti-conqueror in Marmontel's *Les Incas*, explained to villains Davila and Valverde that Spain should have imposed on America a ‘modest tribute’ only, initiating a ‘mutually useful commerce’ instead of plundering and enslaving its inhabitants.⁶⁴ Las Casas rejected Amerindian slavery altogether in the name of equality, and insisted that the pope gave the New World to the church to be missionised, not to the crown to be plundered. Only the welfare of America's inhabitants could retroactively legitimise the ‘tyrannical law of conquest’, a utopia for which he continued to work, in vain, for the entire duration of the novel.⁶⁵ Pronouncing the Indians to be ‘free’, Marmontel's Las Casas was the first to ‘give’ them Christianity and subject status, a gift too precious to be properly returned.

In contrast to Van der Straet's depiction of Vespucci (Figure 3) – who, having woken America from her virgin sleep, is now about to rape and name her – Hersent's painting of Las Casas does not suggest signs of paranoia or feelings of revulsion. Vespucci is, however latently, threatened by the danger of engulfment, as the cannibal scene of breastfeeding Indian women indicates in the background. But there is nothing in Hersent's painting – or in Moreau's earlier etching – that indicates ego-threatening boundary loss. All contours are razor-sharp; Las Casas, Henri and his wife preserve perfect – that is, classical – composure and poise. Judging from Landon's slightly yawning gesture in referring to Hersent's painting, the art-conscious public did not seem to be disturbed or provoked by the representation of a weak old man suckling from his native nurse.



Figure 3: Theodor Galle, etching, after Jan van der Straet, *America* (c.1588–1612). British Museum.

Of course, pre- and post-revolutionary audiences might have shielded their potentially voyeuristic, erotic interest in Hersent's painting or other renderings of Roman Charity behind the thin veil of academic connoisseurship. Pointing to the topic's ancient origins, moralising content and Christian, allegorical metamorphosis, viewers might have employed a distancing device after all. The anonymous art critic of the *Journal Encyclopédique*, for example, remarks in a decisively disengaged manner that Louis-Jean-François Lagrenée's *Roman Charity* (Figure 4), exhibited in the *Salon* of 1765, 'is not of a new style; but ... it is the most finished of his works: the head of the woman is of the greatest beauty; the anxiety that agitates her renders her only more touching'.⁶⁶ Diderot, by contrast, an influential *philosophe* in pre-revolutionary Parisian salons, rejected all such attempts at academic refinement. He insisted on a most transparent – that is, literal and realistic – interpretation of this 'grandiose theme'. In his biting critique of the same painting by Lagrenée, he demands that 'the pathos of rare humanity' of the subject matter be treated in a much 'grander' style. This was to be achieved by eliminating all classicising and idealising traces: the old man was to exhibit clear signs of suffering and emaciation, though without appearing hideous, and should precipitate himself in his need towards the nurse, with his chains holding his arms back, behind his shoulders.⁶⁷ Concerning the nurse, Diderot has even more specific directions: 'I need(!) a woman of at least thirty years, of grand character, strict and honest, but of tender and pious expression ... Her long, unkempt hair should loosely surround her head ... She should be simply dressed ... Her breasts should not be nice and round, but two big boobs full of milk (*mamelles*)'.⁶⁸

In his critique of Jean-Jacques Bachelier's *Roman Charity*, also exhibited in 1765 (Figure 5), Diderot seems to utterly contradict his earlier pronouncements on Lagrenée,



Figure 4: Louis-Jean-François Lagrenée the Elder, *Caritas Romana* (1765). Musée des Augustins, Toulouse (photo: Daniel Martin).

raging against the very realism he recommended a few pages earlier. Pero, without her idealising beauty and fashionably perky bosom, looks like a ‘monster’, a ‘hyena’ or – even worse – a *mestiça* born to a Mexican mother.⁶⁹ Her posture was improbable, and the painter’s feeble attempt to rival Rembrandt’s play of light and shadow were in Diderot’s eyes too ambitious for such a lack of talent, better employed in painting flowers. Above all, ‘your woman . . . is not the woman of nice, large breasts that I desire’.⁷⁰ Looking at Bachelier’s rendition of Pero’s ample bosom, one does not quite know what to make of this comment, but there is no end to Diderot’s nervously quizzical complaints. Criticising Lagrenée for representing Pero in the act of noticing that the prison guards are watching her, thus making her too self-conscious for his taste, Diderot now objects to Bachelier’s couple’s undivided attention to each other, their total immersion in the act and obliviousness to any possible outside disturbance in this uterine, cave-like dungeon.

How are we to interpret Diderot’s contradictory polemic against two artistic renderings of an iconographic topic that he admitted was of great – even intimate – interest to him (‘I need a woman . . . of two big boobs’)? What are we to make of this epoch’s obsession with the blatant undoing of the father figure, his inexplicable apathy and fatal weakness, his regression to an infantile, even pre-natal state, but also the proclamation of his eventual rejuvenation and survival, as indicated by the extreme interest in portrayals of the ‘Roman Charity’? Does the motif’s popularity indicate a collective fantasy of a new kind of patriarchy, reborn and reformed? Otherwise, Diderot’s identification with the old man at the breast of the woman he needs would not make much sense. The frequency with which French painters rendered this theme testifies to a vested interest in the question of family structures, maternal



Figure 5: Jean-Jacques Bachelier, *Caritas Romana* (1764). Ecole nationale supérieure des beaux-arts, Paris.

breastfeeding and father–daughter relations among Enlightenment as well as post-revolutionary audiences.⁷¹

As defined in Rousseau's *Émile* (1762), Diderot and D'Alembert's *Encyclopédie* (1751–1772), and elsewhere, breastfeeding was a citizen mother's first duty.⁷² The campaign against wet-nursing meant not only that a mother should nurse her own children but, negatively defined, that she shouldn't nurse anybody else's. It aimed at the construction of well-defined boundaries of kinship and belonging, for which the closed circuit of milk exchange between a mother and her 'blood'-related child came to be the means and metaphor. In a society in which up to 80 per cent of urban infants were farmed out to rural nurses, and 22 per cent of all baptised children were abandoned, the promotion of maternal nursing was primarily aimed at lowering infant mortality rates.⁷³ In Rouen, the attempt to curb child abandonment by paying poor

mothers ‘salaries’ for breastfeeding their own infants was hugely successful, showing that the cycle of displacing baby care could be broken by financially supporting women who might otherwise have sold their milk to middle-class parents.⁷⁴ Furthermore, Inge Baxmann has argued that the polemic against wet-nursing was an integral part of the political programme to establish ‘transparency’ by refusing to have mothers ‘delegate’ their natural duties to ‘mercenaries’.⁷⁵ Ideals of direct democracy were mapped onto ‘authentic’ maternal breasts, while wet nurses came to symbolise the dissimulation and intrigues of *ancien régime* society.

The urgency with which Enlightenment *philosophes* and revolutionaries insisted on exclusive maternal nursing rendered the traditional repertoire of breastfeeding imagery obsolete and meaningless. Catholic charity, allegorised as a woman nursing children other than her own, was replaced by a mother’s love and duty towards no one but her husband’s offspring. Such radical reconstruction of breastfeeding imagery – that is, the transformation of a Catholic symbol of empathy into a sign of revolutionary immediacy and transparency, both associated and conflated with bourgeois domesticity – enabled nursing to acquire new metaphoric associations. In 1793, the Festival of Unity and Indivisibility was celebrated by having deputies to the National Convention drink from the ‘fountain of regeneration’, erected on the ruins of the Bastille (Figure 6). The fountain featured a statue of Nature disguised as Isis, Egyptian fertility goddess, spouting water from her breasts.⁷⁶ Painter Jacques-Louis David envisioned



Figure 6: Charles Monnet (1793), *The Fountain of Regeneration*, engraving by Isidore-Stanislas-Henri Helman, *Les principales journées de la Revolution* (Paris, 1838), p. 378, image no. 138. New York Public Library.

the festival in honour of the nation's rebirth as a celebration of a quasi-egalitarian body politic 'returning' to its source and origin. Using a common chalice, all deputies, arranged by age, were supposed to drink from 'the pure and healing water' that 'Nature' squeezed from her breasts.⁷⁷

Man's refreshingly egalitarian return to a common origin was here imagined as the forging of bonds of fosterage and milk-siblingship, of ties of spiritual kinship and ideological belonging diametrically opposed to the domestic confines of legitimate blood-kinship that maternal nursing had come to represent. As mothers were to deny their milk to children other than their own, Nature – public mother-goddess figure – sprayed cleansing water over the delegates to the convention without appearing inauthentic.

After the revolution, several authors and artists revisited the theme of breastfeeding and colonial bloodshed, emphasising (like Marmontel) the absence of maternal nursing amid scenes of violence in favour of other types of milk exchange. For example, Heinrich von Kleist (1777–1811) – famous among Lacanian literary critics for structuring his plots as chain reactions of displacements, and revealing the frustrations of modern phallic desire in its endless search for substitutes – highlighted non-maternal care as crucial to surviving in the violent environment of seventeenth-century Latin America.⁷⁸ Milk-siblingship and foster care were at the heart of his novella *The Earthquake in Chile* (1810–11).⁷⁹ François-René de Chateaubriand (1768–1848) – exiled French aristocrat, critic of the revolution, and best-selling author of *Atala* (1801) and *René* (1802) – portrayed the American colonies as dystopian spaces where European exiles encounter Indian soulmates, whose experiences of loss ironically match their own. In his novellas, incestuous, regressive and necrophilic desires govern the protagonists' quests; cross-racial love stories remain unconsummated; mothers spill milk on their dead infants' graves; and a native heroine's virgin suicide symbolises not only the Indians' genocide but the dismemberment of France's aristocracy, two 'nobilities' – one savage, the other civilised – both doomed to extinction.⁸⁰

Numerous artists, such as Henriette Lorimier (*Salon* of 1802), Claude Gautherot (*Salon* of 1802), Louis Hersent (*Salon* of 1806) and Anne-Louis de Roussy Girodet-Trioson (*Salon* of 1808), were inspired to render scenes from *Atala*, a tragic romance between a *mestiça* princess and her adoptive half-brother, Chactas.⁸¹ *Atala* and Chactas cannot consummate their relationship due to a vow of chastity *Atala* made on her mother's deathbed; unaware of the possibility of annulling her vow, she chooses to commit suicide rather than risk losing her virginity. Whereas Hersent chose to portray *Atala* dying in Chactas's arms after having learned of the futility of her deed, Girodet's much more popular version concentrates on the erotic display of her body.⁸² In 1835, Delacroix completed his painting *The Last of the Natchez* (begun in 1823), representing a scene from the epilogue to *Atala* in which Chateaubriand gives a cameo appearance, narrating how he happened upon a Natchez Indian and his wife during his travels through America's wilderness. Asked why she is cradling a dead infant and wetting his lips with her milk, the inconsolable mother explains, 'I gave birth to my child, but since my milk was bad because of my sorrows, it died'.⁸³ Chateaubriand learns that the couple are the last remaining survivors of their tribe, all but eradicated in three subsequent uprisings against the French half a century earlier, and that the mournful mother is the granddaughter of Chactas's adoptive European father.⁸⁴ Merging fact and fiction in a literary *métissage à la* Marmontel, but also emphasising that actual miscegenation



Figure 7: Henriette Lorimier, *A Mother Watching a Goat Nurse Her Child*, engraving in C. P. Landon, *Annales du musée et de l'école moderne des beaux-arts*, vol. 9 (1805), pl. 72. Harvard University, Widener Library.

had, once again, ended in infant death and cultural decay, Chateaubriand expands on the central theme of *Les Incas* while rejecting its main message.⁸⁵ Enlightened utopian plans for renegotiating colonialism by infusing contacts with America's noble savages with reciprocity had utterly failed; in *Atala*, the Spanish genocide in the New World allegorically prefigures the destruction of the *ancien régime* and its ruling elite instead.

The Natchez mother's ineptitude at breastfeeding, caused by grief and resulting in the end of a civilisation, corresponds to the melancholy and sadness felt by the subject in *A Mother Watching a Goat Nurse her Child* (Figure 7), a painting by Lorimier (1804).⁸⁶ By portraying the mother's depression in watching a goat suckle her baby, Lorimier draws attention to contemporary physicians' passionate polemic against the degenerative effects of wet-nursing and their recommendation, against their better knowledge, of using animal milk for infants whenever maternal breastfeeding was not an option.⁸⁷ Of course, this painting also suggests the extended meaning of the Enlightenment maxim 'a mother's first duty' – mothers were not supposed to nurse anyone's children but their own. Only fathers could occasionally lay claim to women's breasts, for they, as suggested by the visual imagery of the Roman Charity, emerged as the true and uncontested owners of their daughters' milk. In this sense, the young

mother's sadness conveys a profound feeling of alienation in a society in which the reform of infant care unfolded, once again, in the name of the father – that is, under the control of medical professionals and lawmakers who refused to let women's voices render the 'transparency' of their body language opaque.

Two other paintings, exhibited in the *Salons* of 1800 and 1804, suggest that the reorganisation of breastfeeding as an exclusively maternal duty was at the centre of fashioning the new rule of (the same old?) fathers. In 1800, Étienne Barthélemy Garnier exhibited a much-discussed depiction of Roman Charity (now lost), illustrating a largely overlooked twin version of Valerius Maximus's anecdote of filial piety, in which a daughter breastfeeds her mother.⁸⁸ The *Mercur de France* praised Garnier for having followed Diderot's earlier recommendations to Lagrenée by abolishing all eroticising, idealising features – which in this case would have been entirely inappropriate – and in rendering the scene as 'historical fact'. Garnier's nursing daughter is particularly interesting in the eyes of the reviewer because of the 'contrasting sentiments' she is shown to harbour in nursing her mother. Unlike the other heroines of Roman Charity who fed their fathers, she has brought her son to prison.⁸⁹ Although her child is also hungry, she continues to feed her mother, who agonises over consuming her grandson's nourishment.⁹⁰ Nicolas Poussin had already painted the mother–daughter–child triad as part of his work *The Distribution of Manna in the Desert* (1637–39). In his commentary to the painting, exhibited at the *Salon* during the first decade of the nineteenth century, Charles Landon emphasised – much like the reviewer of Garnier's painting in the *Mercur de France* – how Poussin's breastfeeding daughter is caught between two conflicting duties.⁹¹ Cimon, in contrast, usually enjoyed the undivided attention of his daughter-nurse. While the many pre-revolutionary portrayals of Cimon in the act of suckling acquired metaphorical significance as patriarchy embattled and reformed, Garnier's painting of the mother–daughter pair was understood literally, as dramatising the nurse's difficult choice in favouring mother over son, rightful owner of her milk.

The relationship between Cimon and Pero – and by extension between Las Casas and his nurse – was politically charged because it staged the problem of paternal power as profoundly ambiguous. It carried incestuous as well as anti-incestuous associations insofar as it played on the inevitable arousal and necessary repression of sexual desire for one's nurse. It cast parental and filial obligations as mutual, pointing to Pero's sacrifice as the return of a gift received, even though the symmetry of this exchange remains questionable. But, above all, it implicitly declared that patriarchal rule might be coming to an end. What if Pero changed her mind? After all, her father was guilty of a heinous crime. Why not let him die, finally, once and for all?

In her book *The Family Romance of the French Revolution* (1992), Lynn Hunt argues that the revolutionary dynamic unfolded as an oedipal tragedy, in which the fraternal killing of the father, Louis XVI, was followed by the delirious gang-rape of the mother, Marie-Antoinette, who, subject to pornographic slandering even before the revolution, was executed in 1793 for having committed incest with her son.⁹² According to Hunt, the breakdown of political hierarchies was discursively produced and performed as parricide and incest; the re-establishment of central authority under Napoleon was possible only after fraternal infighting had ended. Such interest in the reform of paternal power, as well as anxiety over its compatibility with brotherly egalitarianism, characterised much of Enlightenment fiction, journalism and political philosophy.

Marmontel's *Les Incas* is no exception. It is a moralising tale in which fathers – both good and bad, native as well as Spanish – strive for influence in the drama of conquest and in which, due to the weakness of *Über*-father Charles V (r.1516–56), the wrong party prevails. Las Casas figures as the only true father and moral authority in the New World, recognised by Pizarro and the Incas alike, even though his project of reforming white patriarchal rule through a particular form of creolisation failed. Just as the novel's utopian, cross-racial love story between Cora and Alonzo ends in disaster, following the tragic plots of contemporary English abolitionist fiction analysed by Marie-Louise Pratt, Marmontel's fantasy of 'affiliating' America to Europe through trade and reciprocity could not flourish within the space of the novel.⁹³

The narrative and visual portrayal of native mothers was even more problematic than the rendering of cross-racial romances. Fiction writers' refusal to endow any form of miscegenation with a happy outcome sits uneasily with the widespread phenomenon of cross-racial reproduction in the colonies, much discussed at the time by ethnographers, economists and natural scientists.⁹⁴ Cora's child is stillborn, while Atala, herself a *mestiça*, commits suicide to avoid losing her virginity. More poignantly, none of the many lactation scenes in *Les Incas*, *Atala* and *The Earthquake in Chile* – such as indigenous mothers' spilling of milk onto their infants' graves, fantasies of cross-racial adult breastfeeding and white women's exchange of nurslings, respectively – even remotely reflects the proverbial good care that native mothers were supposed to have lavished on their children in earlier literature, nor do they hint at the widespread practice of cross-racial wet-nursing.⁹⁵ As Bianca Premo, Megan Vaughan and others have shown, black or indigenous slaves and domestics routinely nursed white children in the colonies until at least the nineteenth century.⁹⁶ The overtly metaphorical treatment of breastfeeding by Marmontel, Kleist and Chateaubriand thus appears to be profoundly problematic, because it not only obfuscates an important feature of colonial society in both the pre- and post-revolutionary eras but brackets the question of slavery and its creolising effects. Hersent's revisiting of Marmontel's theme of Las Casas and his Amerindian nurse in 1808 thus suggests that the actual, forced intimacy of master–slave relations continued to be in need of disavowal.⁹⁷

Marmontel's and Hersent's colonial adaptation of the ancient motif of Cimon and Pero, the breastfeeding father–daughter couple, thus raises important questions about the connections between paternity, mothering, kinship and race at a moment when all four concepts were being redefined in relation to one another. The significance of white paternal blood in the process of generation appears to be under intense scrutiny in such portrayals of lactation. The insistence on the 'pious' nature of Pero's filial milk-offering – that is, its representation as anything but indecent or incestuous – suggests just how feeble the role of paternal blood and sperm had become in the imagination of Enlightenment intellectuals seeking to reform family and state. As the list of publications on slavery and colonial relations in the years preceding the publication of Marmontel's novel (1777) indicates, any such reform project had to take race relationships into consideration. Just as Pero's milk whitewashed her father's guilt and gave him a chance for survival, the Indian woman's breast cured Las Casas from an episode of fatal weakness and redeemed him from his own past as *encomendero*. Henri's beautiful wife adopted Las Casas into the morally superior world of noble savages as a counter-gift for his conversion efforts, while African mothers' beastliness continued to be signified by their extended 'mammals' and the lack of affection for

their infants.⁹⁸ Whereas cross-racial romances could not be imagined to produce viable offspring for the emerging body politic of French male democrats and always ended tragically to avoid miscegenation, the allegorisation of America as breastfeeding charity in Marmontel's *Les Incas* circumvented problems of racial hybridity and provided Enlightenment audiences with the reassuring fiction of a more peacefully gendered model of exploitation than rape.

Notes

1. Anne-Marie de Brem, *Louis Hersent: 1777–1860: Peintre d'histoire et portraitiste* (Paris: Paris-Musées, 1993), p. 38.
2. According to Susanne Zantop, Henri is a historical persona, named Enriquillo in Las Casas's own *Brief Account of the Destruction of the Indies* (1552), in which he is mentioned as a Central American rebel leader against Spanish conquistadors. Susanne Zantop, 'Domesticating the Other: European Colonial Fantasies 1770–1830', in Gisela Brinker-Gabler (ed.), *Encountering the Other(s): Studies in Literature, History, and Culture* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995), pp. 269–84, here p. 277. In Marmontel's novel, Henri is the only one who knows the cure to Las Casas's mysterious illness: 'They say that you are attacked by a disease against which the milk of a woman is useful'. Jean-François Marmontel, *Les Incas, ou la destruction de l'Empire du Pérou* (Paris, 1777), repr. in Marmontel, *Oeuvres Complètes*, vol. 8 (Paris, 1818), p. 387.
3. Charles-Paul Landon, *Annales du Musée et de l'École moderne des beaux-arts* (Paris, 1808–35), Salon de 1808, vol. 2, pp. 36–7.
4. For more sources, see Karl-Ludwig Löhdorf, *Marmontels Incas* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Bonn, 1980); Monique Delhome-Sanciaud, 'L'Amérique', in Jacques Wagner (ed.), *Marmontel, un intellectuel exemplaire au siècle des Lumières* (Tulle: Editions Mille Sources, 2003), pp. 103–23.
5. Marmontel, *Oeuvres Complètes*, vol. 8, p. 105.
6. Marmontel, *Oeuvres Complètes*, vol. 8, pp. 381–9.
7. Contemporary observers, on the other hand, paid attention to the scene: 'Las Casas is attacked by an illness against which woman's milk is therapeutic. Guardian Angel of this new world, Pizarro says to her, happy in governing all of our hearts! Others have subjugated the Indies, but only you have subjected it to yourself through the ascendance of virtue'. Review of *Les Incas* in *Le Journal Encyclopédique* 4/1 (May 1777), p. 89. On Cora and Alonzo in *Les Incas*, see, most recently, Deborah Poole, *Vision, Race, and Modernity: A Visual Economy of the Andean Image World* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997), pp. 25–57.
8. Delhome-Sanciaud, 'L'Amérique', p. 111. Translations: Jean-François Marmontel, *The Incas, or the destruction of the empire of Peru* (Dublin: Price, 1777; London: J. Nourse, 1777); *De Incas, of de verwoesting van het rijk van Peru* (Rotterdam, 1777); *Inki ili Razrushenie Peruanskoi Imperii* (Moscow, 1778); *Gl'Incas ovvero La distruzione dell'impero del Peru* (Venice, 1778); *Los Incas, ó, La destrucción del imperio del Perú* (Paris, 1822); *Os Incas, ou, A destruição do imperio do Peru* (Paris, 1837). Reprints: Marmontel, *Les Incas: ou la destruction de l'empire de Pérou* (Paris: Lacombe, 1777). Other French editions up to 1817: Amsterdam, 1777; Frankfurt and Leipzig, 1777; Liège, 1777; Berne, 1777; Neuchâtel, 1777; Paris, 1778; Leiden, 1783; Paris, 1787; Frankfurt and Leipzig, 1792; Paris, 1794; Paris, c.1800; London, 1808; Frankfurt and Leipzig, 1809; Lyon, 1810; Paris, 1810; Lyon, 1811; Paris, 1813; London, 1814; Lyon, 1817; Paris, 1817.
9. Johann Gottlieb Naumann, *Cora: Eine Oper* (Leipzig: Dykischen Buch Handlung, 1780); Domenico Ricciardi, *Alonzo e Cora: Ballo eroico . . . da rappresentarsi nel Teatro da S. Agostino in Genova dell'anno 1787* (Genoa, 1787); Thomas Morton, *Columbus, or A world discovered: an historical play, as is performed at the Theatre-Royal, Covent Garden* (London, 1792; repr. Washington, 1823); Andrei Ivanovich Bukharskii, *Kora k Alonzu, iroida* (Saint Petersburg, 1793); Giovanni Simone Mayr, *Alonso e Cora: Libretto* (Milan, 1804; 2nd edn, Bergamo, 1809); Frederick Reynolds, *The Virgin of the Sun: An Operatic Drama* (London, 1812).
10. Estuardo Nuñez, 'Marmontel y su fortuna literaria en America: El asunto de Cora en Rafael Agostini', *Revista nacional de la cultura* 255/4 (1984), pp. 54–66.
11. Darcy Grimaldo Grigsby, 'Food Chains: French Abolitionism and Human Consumption (1787–1819)', in Geoff Quilley and Kay Dian Kriz (eds), *An Economy of Colour: Visual Culture and the Atlantic World, 1660–1830* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003), pp. 153–75.
12. Alice Weinreb, 'Red Mothers and White Milk: Maternal Lactation and American Indians in Post-Revolutionary France', *West Virginia University Philological Papers* 52 (2005), pp. 17–23. Weinreb,

- unfortunately, misidentifies the source of Hersent's painting. Following Schiebinger and Kirchhoff, an unspecified 'legend' is given as textual origin rather than Marmontel's novel. Londa Schiebinger, *Nature's Body: Gender in the Making of Modern Science* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1993), p. 60; Heinz Kirchhoff, 'Die künstlerische Darstellung der weiblichen Brust als Attribut der Weiblichkeit und Fruchtbarkeit als auch der Spende der Lebenskraft', *Geburtshilfe und Frauenheilkunde, Ergebnisse der Forschung für die Praxis* 50 (1990), pp. 234–43, here p. 240. See also Reinhold Schneider, *Las Casas vor Karl V: Szenen aus der konquistadorenzeit* (Leipzig; Insel-Verlag, 1938).
13. Ann McClintock, *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender, and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest* (New York: Routledge, 1995), pp. 21–74; Nerissa S. Balce, 'The Filipina's Breast: Savagery, Docility, and the Erotics of the American Empire', *Social Text* 87/2 (2006), pp. 89–110; Carolyn Dean, 'Savage Breast/Salvaged Breast: Allegory, Colonization, and Wet-Nursing in Peru, 1532–1825', in Cristelle Baskins and Lisa Rosenthal (eds), *Early Modern Visual Allegory: Embodying Meaning* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007), pp. 265–79. According to Alain Milhou, the myth of the noble savage is as old as the discovery of the New World itself, going back to Columbus's portrayal of native Americans as 'adamitic'. In his diary entry of 12 October 1492, Columbus described the inhabitants of Haiti and the Bahamas as naked, docile and naturally monotheistic. Las Casas differentiated between the 'noble savages' of Central America and the high civilisations of Peru and Mexico. Milhou, 'Die Neue Welt als geistiges und moralisches Problem (1492–1609)', in Walther L. Bernecker, Raymond Th. Buve, John R. Fisher, Horst Pietschmann and Hans Werner Tobler (eds), *Handbuch der Geschichte Lateinamerikas*, vol. 1 (Stuttgart: Kröner, 1994), pp. 274–96, here pp. 282, 287. See also Bartolomé de las Casas, *Apologética historia sumaria quanto a las cualidades, dispusición, descripción, . . .*, ed. Edmundo O'Gorman, 2 vols (Mexico City: Editorial Porrúa, 1967), vol. 1, p. clxvi; Stephanie Merrim, 'The Counter-Discourse of Bartolomé de las Casas', in Jerry M. Williams and Robert E. Lewis (eds), *Early Images of the Americas: Transfer and Invention* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1993), pp. 149–62; Santa Arias, 'Empowerment Through the Writing of History: Bartolomé de Las Casas's Representation of the Other(s)', in Williams and Lewis (eds), *Early Images of the Americas*, pp. 163–79.
 14. Valerius Maximus, *Memorable Doings and Sayings*, ed. D. R. Shackleton Bailey, 2 vols (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2000), vol. 1, bk. 5, no. 4, pp. 501–3.
 15. In the wake of Lynn Hunt's book *The Family Romance of the French Revolution* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992), several historians have noted how political discourse in eighteenth-century France was couched as a discourse on family relationships. Thomas Crow, in particular, has discussed the art of Jacques-Louis David and his followers as preoccupied with 'the troubled territory of filiation and inheritance'. He calls his book 'a history of missing fathers'. Thomas Crow, *Emulation: David, Drouais, and Girodet in the Art of Revolutionary France* (1994; 2nd edn, New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2006), p. 1. Françoise Vergès approaches colonial relations between France and Réunion, a small island in the Indian Ocean, as characterised by an imagined reciprocity of gift-exchange between colonised 'children' and France, 'La Mère-Patrie'. Françoise Vergès, *Monsters and Revolutionaries: Colonial Family Romance and Métissage* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1999), p. 6.
 16. Guillaume Thomas Raynal, *Philosophical and Political History of the Settlements and Trade of the Europeans in the West and East Indies* (1770; London, 1776). Denis Diderot collaborated on the influential third edition of 1780. Hervé Guénot, 'La réception de l'*Histoire des deux Indes* dans la presse d'expression française (1772–1781)', in Hans-Jürgen Lüsebrink and Manfred Tietz (eds), *Lectures de Raynal: L'Histoire des deux Indes en Europe et en Amérique au XVIIIe siècle* (Oxford: Voltaire Foundation, 1991), pp. 67–84. On Diderot's involvement, see also Srinivas Aravamudan, 'Review: Trop(icaliz)ing the Enlightenment', *Diacritics* 23/3 (1993), pp. 48–68, here p. 49. On the slave trade in French Enlightenment literature, see, most recently, Christopher L. Miller, *The French Atlantic Triangle: Literature and Culture of the Slave Trade* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2008). Among the 'enlightened' reading public in pre-revolutionary France, abolitionist and anti-abolitionist views were equally represented. See e.g., the entry 'Negres' (Negroes) in Denis Diderot and Jean le Rond d'Alembert (eds), *Encyclopédie, où dictionnaire raisonné des sciences, des arts, et des métiers* (Paris, 1751–65), vol. 10, pp. 79–83; for a full text online, see ARTFL Encyclopédie Project (Spring 2010 edition), Robert Morrissey (ed.), <<http://encyclopedia.uchicago.edu/>>. For contemporary reviews of books on either Africans or French slaves in the Caribbean in the *Journal Encyclopédique (JE)*, see, among others, the review of Abbé Roubeau's anonymously published *Histoire générale de l'Asie, de l'Afrique & de l'Amérique*, 3 vols (Paris, 1774), in *JE* (April–May 1775), vol. 3/2, pp. 249–61; vol. 3/3, pp. 397–408; vol. 4/1, pp. 15–25; review of M. Doigni, *Discours d'un Nègre à un Européen* (Paris, 1775), in *JE* (December 1775), vol. 8/3, pp. 500–05; review of P. Nicolson's anonymously published *Essai sur l'histoire naturelle de l'isle de St. Domingue* (Paris, 1776), in *JE* (February 1776), vol. 1/3, pp. 451–59; review of Guillaume Thomas Raynal, *L'Histoire philosophique et politique*

- des établissements et du commerce des Européens dans les deux Indes (Amsterdam, 1770), in *JE* (March 1776), vol. 2/3 pp. 425–40; review of M. Fusée Aublet, *Histoire des plantes de la Guiane française . . . avec plusieurs mémoires sur différents objets intéressans* (Paris, 1776), in *JE* (April–May 1776), vol. 3/2, pp. 241–50; vol. 3/3, pp. 399–409; vol. 4/1, pp. 25–35; review of Jean-Barthélemy Dazille, *Observations sur les maladies des Negres* (Paris, 1776), in *JE* (December 1776), vol. 8/3, pp. 452–8; review of Abbé Proyard, *Histoire de Loango, Kakongo, & autres royaumes d'Afrique* (Lyon, 1776), in *JE* (January 1777), vol. 1/1, pp. 36–53; Abbé de la Caille, *Journal historique du voyage fait au cap de Bonne-Espérance* (Paris, 1776), in *JE* (February 1777), vol. 3/3, pp. 423–35; review of *Considérations sur l'état présent de la colonie française de St. Domingue* (Paris, 1777), anonymously published by Michel-René Hilliard d'Auberteuil, in *JE* (September 1777), vol. 6/2, pp. 191–205; vol. 6/3, pp. 389–402.
17. See also Schiebinger, *Nature's Body*; Marilyn Yalom, *A History of the Breast* (New York: Knopf, 1997).
 18. Hunt, *Family Romance*.
 19. Pliny the Elder (c.23–79 CE), *Natural History*, ed. and tr. W. H. S. Jones (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1991), book 28, xxi, pp. 51–5; Marsilio Ficino, *De vita libri tres* (Basel, 1529), pp. 77–8; Lorentz Burres von Neunkirchen, *Ein new Wund Artzney Büchlein vor nihe an den Tag gegeben Durch den erfarnen Meister Lorentzen Burres von Neunkirchen* (n.p., 1549), fols 5v, 7r, 10r; Christophorus Wirsung, *Artzney Buch darinn werden fast alle eusserliche und innerlich Glieder des Menschlichen leibs mit ihrer gestalt eigenschafft und würckung beschriben* (Heidelberg, 1568); Hermann Schelenz, *Geschichte der Pharmazie* (Hildesheim: Gg Olms, 1965), pp. 40, 57, 96, 100, 167, 819; Heinrich Vorwahl, 'Deutsche Volksmedizin in Vergangenheit und Gegenwart', in Elfriede Grabner (ed.), *Volksmedizin: Probleme und Forschungsgeschichte* (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1967), pp. 260–61.
 20. Diderot and D'Alembert (eds), *Encyclopédie, où dictionnaire raisonné*, vol. 9, p. 207.
 21. Johann Georg Greisel, *Tractatus medicus de Cura Lactis in Arthritide in quo indagata natura lactis et arthritidis tandem rationibus, et experientiis allatis, diaeta lactea, optima arthritidem curandi methodus, proponitur* (1681; Leipzig, 1779), pp. 144–5.
 22. Only Heinrich Doorschodt recommended female milk openly; see his 'De Lacte Commentatio', in Ioh. Georgius Fridericus Franzius (ed.), *De Lacte Humano eiusque cum Asinino et Ovillo comparatione observatines chemicae* (Leipzig, 1773), pp. 120–21. Among authors who praised animal milk as a valid substitute, see Floris Iacobi Voltelen, in Franzius (ed.), *De Lacte Humano*, pp. xiv–xv. On quotes from Pliny and Ficino, see Greisel, *Tractatus medicus*, pp. 255, 283. On references to wet-nursing, see Johann Doläus, *Tractatus novus nunquam antehac editus de furia podagrae lacte victa & mitigata, propria experientia conscriptus* (Amsterdam, 1705), pp. 87–8.
 23. *Wassersucht*: this disease causes water to collect in the patient's feet and legs (dropsy).
 24. Heide Wunder, 'Frauenmilch-Muttermilch. Eine Geschichte aus dem 18. Jahrhundert', in Barbara Duden, Karen Hagemann, Regina Schulte and Ulrike Weckel (eds), *Geschichte in Geschichten: Ein historisches Lesebuch* (Frankfurt am Main: Campus Fachbuch, 2003), pp. 295–305.
 25. Leopold von Orlich, *Friedrich Wilhelm der Grosse Kurfürst: Nach bisher noch ungekannten Original-Handschriften* (Berlin: Posen und Bemberg, 1836), pp. 111–17.
 26. Dorinda Outram, *The Body and the French Revolution: Sex, Class, and Political Culture* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989), pp. 141–3.
 27. Mme de Roland, 'Avis a ma fille', in L.-A. Champagneux (ed.), *Oeuvres de J. M. Ph. Roland, femme de l'ex-ministre de l'Intérieur* (Paris, 1799–1800), vol. 1, pp. 307–8. Interestingly, Georg Sussman misreads the evidence, assuming that Mme de Roland rented an infant instead of an adult woman to suck from her breasts. Georg Sussman, *Selling Mother's Milk: The Wet-Nursing Business in France 1715–1914* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1982), p. 85.
 28. 'I feel much better; I have found a woman who sucks me two or three times daily in order to prevent the loss of the milk'. *Lettres de Madame Roland*, ed. Claude Perroud, vol. 1 (1780–87) (Paris: Imprimerie nationale, 1900), no. 25, 30 November 1781, p. 80.
 29. 'My stomach is perfectly restored; I eat like a nurse; my milk has become sweet; its quantity is so far very limited, even though the pressure of my fingers makes it come out in jets. Since this has happened, my doctor is of the opinion that I remit my *tireuse* [= *téteuse*] and use only my child; although she [the child] is very impatient because she does not get enough, I will try to do so anyways'. *Lettres de Madame Roland*, ed. Perroud, no. 35, 9 January 1782, p. 126.
 30. *Lettres de Madame Roland*, ed. Perroud, no. 39, 11 January 1782, p. 131.
 31. Maximus, *Memorable Doings and Sayings*; Robert Rosenblum, 'Caritas Romana after 1760: Some Romantic Lactations', in Thomas B. Hess and Linda Nochlin (eds), *Woman as Sex Object* (New York: Newsweek, 1972), pp. 43–63; Renato Raffaelli, Roberto M. Danese and Settimio Lanciotti (eds), *Pietas e allattamento filiale: La vicenda – l'exemplum – l'iconografia* (Urbino: Quattro Venti, 1997); Andor Pigler,

- Barockthemen*, 2 vols (Budapest: Ungarischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1965), vol. 2, pp. 284–92.
32. Maximus, *Memorable Doings and Sayings*; see also Hyginus (64 BCE–17 CE), *Fables*, ed. Jean-Yves Boriaud (Paris: Les belles lettres, 1997), book 254, p. 158.
 33. Frescoes from Pompeii already depicted the father–daughter scene, while corresponding terracotta figures were found in the south of France and Central Europe, pointing to Hellenistic art from Alexandria as a possible source of the iconography. Fausto Zevi, *La Casa Reg. IX.5, 18=21 a Pompei e le sue pitture* (Rome: L’Erma di Bretschneider, 1964). Anna Santucci, ‘Micone e Pero: L’iconografia antica’, in Raffaelli, Danese and Lanciotti (eds), *Pietas e allattamento*, pp. 123–39.
 34. Caravaggio integrated the theme into his famous altarpiece ‘The Seven Works of Mercy’ (Naples, 1606–07). Grazia Maria Fachechi, ‘L’iconografia della Caritas Romana dal Medioevo a Caravaggio’, in Raffaelli, Danese and Lanciotti (eds), *Pietas e allattamento*, pp. 227–45; Anna Tuck-Scala, ‘Caravaggio’s “Roman Charity” in the Seven Acts of Mercy’, in Jeanne Chenault Porter and Susan Scott Munshower (eds), *Parthenope’s Splendor: Art of the Golden Age in Naples* (University Park: Pennsylvania State University, 1993), pp. 127–63. On second-order incest, whereby the daughter takes the place not of her mother but of her grandmother, see Roberto Danese, ‘Lac Humanum Fellare: La trasmissione del latte e la linea della generazione’, in Raffaelli, Danese and Lanciotti (eds), *Pietas e allattamento*, pp. 40–72.
 35. According to Aristotle, women contribute inert matter to the process of generation; men, the form- and soul-giving active principle. ‘The Generation of Animals’, in *The Complete Works of Aristotle*, ed. Jonathan Barnes, 2 vols (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984), vol. 1, 1133.
 36. ‘It was thus necessary to either renounce the colonisation of the New World, or to limit oneself to a peaceful trade with the Indians . . . In order to renounce the conquest, one would have needed a kind of wisdom that the common people have never had, and which kings possess only rarely. To limit oneself to the free exchange of mutual assistance would have been the most just: because, due to the new needs and new pleasures, the Indian would have become more industrious, more active’. Marmontel, *Les Incas*, p. 9. ‘Virtuous Las Casas, answered Pizarro, your views and mine are in agreement. Have them venerate my God, have them obey my king, impose on these peoples a moderate tribute, and establish between them and Spain a commerce useful and advantageous to them both; this is what I propose’. Marmontel, *Les Incas*, p. 116.
 37. Margaret R. Miles, ‘The Virgin’s One Bare Breast: Female Nudity and Religious Meaning in Tuscan Early Renaissance Culture’, in Susan R. Suleiman (ed.), *The Female Body in Western Culture* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1986), pp. 193–208; Margaret R. Miles, *A Complex Delight: The Secularization of the Breast* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2008); Megan Holmes, ‘Disrobing the Virgin: The Madonna Lactans in Fifteenth-Century Florentine Art’, in Geraldine A. Johnson and Sara F. Matthews Grieco (eds), *Picturing Women in Renaissance and Baroque Italy* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 167–95; Alain Tapié, Caroline Joubert, Jennifer Montague and Gisèle Jouet (eds), *L’allégorie dans la peinture: La représentation de la charité au XVIIIe siècle*, exhibition catalogue, Caen, 27 June – 13 October 1986 (Caen: Musée des beaux-arts, 1987); Theodora Hadzisteliou Price, *Kourotrophos: Cults and Representations of the Greek Nursing Deities* (Leiden: Brill, 1978); Larissa Bonfante, ‘Nursing Mothers in Classical Art’, in Ann Olga Koloski-Ostrow and Claire L. Lyons (eds), *Naked Truths: Women, Sexuality, and Gender in Classical Art and Archaeology* (London: Routledge, 1997), pp. 174–96. On Central European fairy tales, in which powerful mother figures adopt male heroes through breastfeeding, and in which the establishment of bonds of milk-kinship is presented as a solution to otherwise insurmountable problems, see Kurt Ranke and Rolf Wilhelm Bredmich (eds), *Enzyklopädie des Märchens*, vol. 9 (Berlin: De Gruyter, 1999), col. 665.
 38. Pierre Roussel, *Système physique et moral de la femme, ou tableau Philosophique de la Constitution, de l’Etat organique, du Tempérament, des Moeurs, & des Fonctions propres au Sexe* (Paris, 1775), p. 370.
 39. Madame le Beauvoir, *Rose, suite de Fanfan et Colas, comédie en trois actes et en prose* (Paris, 1806); Garnier, Charles Georges Thomas [under pseud. Mlle Ragner de Malfontaine], ‘Soeurs de lait’ (1746), in *Recueil général des proverbes dramatiques* (London, 1785); *Nanine, Soeur de Lait de la Reine de Golconde, Pastorale en trois actes en ariettes et vaudevilles choisis* (Paris, 1773).
 40. Peggy Davis, ‘La quête de primitivisme ou le doute envers la civilisation: L’illustration visuelle dans *Les Incas* de Marmontel (1777) et *Atala* de Chateaubriand (1801)’, *Etudes littéraires* 37/3 (2006), pp. 117–44.
 41. Delhome-Sanciaud, ‘L’Amérique’, p. 119.
 42. Marmontel, *Oeuvres complètes*, vol. 8, p. 387.
 43. Marmontel, *Oeuvres complètes*, vol. 8, pp. 388–9.
 44. Zantop, ‘Domesticating the Other’, p. 277.

45. On the rejuvenation of an ailing body politic, see Mona Ozouf, 'Regeneration', in François Furet and Mona Ozouf (eds), *A Critical Dictionary of the French Revolution* (Cambridge: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1989), pp. 781–91. On reciprocity in *Les Incas*, see endnote 41; on reciprocity in Raynal: 'If I have provisions which they want, and if they have some that are useful to me, I may propose exchanges. We are both of us at liberty to set what price we choose on what belongs to us . . . Exchanges ought to be perfectly free'. Raynal, *Philosophical and Political History*, vol. 4, book 7, pp. 194–5. On wet-nursing, see Sussman, *Selling Mother's Milk*; Inge Baxmann, *Die Feste der Französischen Revolution: Inszenierung von Gesellschaft als Natur* (Weinheim and Basel: Beltz, 1989); Schiebinger, *Nature's Body*; Mary Jacobus, "'Incorruptible Milk": Breastfeeding and the French Revolution', in Mary Jacobus, *First Things: The Maternal Imaginary in Literature, Art, and Psychoanalysis* (New York and London: Routledge, 2005), pp. 207–30.
46. 'El Inca' Garcilaso de la Vega, *The Royal Commentaries of Peru in two parts; the first part treating of the Original of their Incas or Kings: Of their Idolatry: of their Laws and Government both in Peace and War . . . ; the second part: Describing the manner by which that new World was conquered by the Spaniards . . .*, tr. Paul Ricaut (1609; London: M. Flesher, 1688), p. 397. Vega called himself 'doubly noble' because of his descent from Sebastián Garcilaso de la Vega y Vargas (d.1559) and Incan princess Palla Chimpu Ocllo, daughter of Tupac Huallpa; Raynal, *Philosophical and Political History* (1770; London, 1783), vol. 4, book 7, p. 217.
47. Quoted after Aravamudan, 'Review: Trop(icaliz)ing the Enlightenment', p. 61. According to Aravamudan, Medea 'rejuvenates her father-in-law, Aeson, by cutting his throat, removing his blood, and giving him a transfusion of a freshly prepared concoction of sheep's blood, milk, wine, and other ingredients [Ovid 155–66]'.
 48. Contrast with Mary-Louise Pratt's analysis of cross-racial romances in her *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992), pp. 86–110.
49. Aristotle, 'The Generation of Animals', 1132.
50. McClintock, *Imperial Leather*, p. 24.
51. Waldemar Deonna, 'La légende de Pero et de Micon et l'allaitment symbolique', *Latomus* 13 (1954), pp. 140–66, 356–75, here p. 159. In early Arabic as well as Islamic societies, milk-kinship was (and continues to be) legally recognised in its capacity to establish marriage prohibitions. Avner Giladi, *Infants, Parents, and Wet Nurses: Medieval Islamic Views on Breastfeeding and Their Social Implications* (Leiden: Brill, 1999); Valerie Fildes, *Wet Nursing: A History from Antiquity to the Present* (New York: Blackwell, 1988), pp. 26–31. Tribal societies of the Hindu Kush performed adult breastfeeding as a punishment for adultery well into the nineteenth century. It was assumed that an adulteress would forever forego sexual intercourse with her lover once he had become her milk-son. Peter Parkes, 'Alternative Social Structures and Foster Relations in the Hindu Kush: Milk Kinship Allegiance in Former Mountain Kingdoms of Northern Pakistan', *Comparative Studies in History and Society* 43 (2001), pp. 4–36, here p. 10.
52. Christiane Klapisch-Zuber writes how 'certain texts push the masculinity of the formulas to absurd extremes. In 1468, Vergilio Adriani put a daughter out to nurse with the daughter-in-law of one of his sharecroppers, Monna Cosa. Twenty months later he writes: "I agreed with Giovanni di Benozzo and his sons Benozzo [the husband] and Meo that they would no longer give the breast to Alessandra, I mean Monna Cosa". Luca da Panzano says, when he put an illegitimate son out to nurse: "I gave him to nurse 7 February 1423 to Nencio di Martino from Torri in the Valdipesa in exchange for 4 lire 5 soldi per month". The description of the trousseau follows, then the report of the child's death and the following clarification: "Given to Nencio di Nanni from Torri in Valdipesa whose milk was fifteen days old"'. Christiane Klapisch-Zuber, 'Blood Parents and Milk Parents: Wet Nursing in Florence, 1300–1530', in Christiane Klapisch-Zuber, *Women, Family, and Ritual in Renaissance Italy* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985), pp. 132–64, here p. 143 n. 39. See also Richard Trexler, 'Infanticide in Florence: New Sources and First Results', *History of Childhood Quarterly* 1 (1973), pp. 89–116; Richard Trexler, 'The Foundlings of Florence, 1395–1455', *History of Childhood Quarterly* 1 (1973), pp. 259–84. Valerie Fildes writes that in Renaissance Florence, 'The taboo on sexual intercourse during lactation was obviously not practiced, even by the small number of lying-in wet nurses . . . [Fathers] were particularly angered when the nurse did not confess her pregnancy and carried on suckling their child'. Fildes, *Wet Nursing*, pp. 57–8.
53. In his *Universal-Lexikon*, Johann Heinrich Zedler sums up traditional views on how breast milk might get spoilt: 'A woman's milk that is otherwise good and healthy can, through a variety of causes, such as anger, fright, sadness, cold, irregular diet, suddenly become transformed, coagulated, or otherwise spoilt. In particular, forbidden Venus-play can have this effect, which is why, since old times, nurses were forbidden,

- under threat of capital punishment, to engage in it, or to get pregnant'. Interestingly, Zedler points out that sexual activities or pregnancy can render milk bad. Johann Heinrich Zedler, *Grosses Vollständiges Universal-Lexikon*, 64 vols (Halle, 1739), vol. 21, cols. 142–8.
54. On rape as a metaphor for early colonisation, see Louis Montrose, 'The Work of Gender in the Discourse of Discovery', in Stephen Greenblatt (ed.), *New World Encounters* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993), pp. 177–217; McClintock, *Imperial Leather*.
 55. Book review in *Le Mercure de France* (March 1777), pp. 129, 136.
 56. 'If no other problem is noticed . . . the excrements are liquid . . . as are those of children fed only with milk and porridge. This is the sign of a . . . successful cure'. Greisel, *Tractatus medicus*, p. 253.
 57. 'The milk . . . ought to be excellent in its kind; the animal from whence it is taken . . . should be . . . a cow of middle age, of a good habit . . . neither fat nor lean, nor pregnant, and kept separate from the bull'. Doläus, *Tractatus novus*, pp. 87–8.
 58. Greisel, quoting Ficino and Dioscurides, writes, 'Healthiest is the milk of a woman whose body is healthy, not old, but young, beautiful, of a temperate complexion, well-nourished, and of good humor. Dioscurides adds, "The milk that flows directly out of the breast is to be preferred; it is better, more nutritious, and fresh; a woman's milk is sweeter and more nourishing than any other milk"'. Greisel, *Tractatus medicus*, p. 284.
 59. Diderot and D'Alembert, *Encyclopédie ou dictionnaire raisonné*, vol. 9, p. 207.
 60. Marmontel, *Oeuvres complètes*, vol. 8, p. 388.
 61. McClintock, *Imperial Leather*, p. 30; Susan Buck-Morss, 'Hegel and Haiti', *Critical Inquiry* 26 (2000), pp. 821–65.
 62. Celia Brickman, *Aboriginal Populations in the Mind: Race and Primitivity in Psychoanalysis* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003).
 63. McClintock, *Imperial Leather*, pp. 21–2.
 64. Marmontel, *Oeuvres Complètes*, vol. 8, p. 116.
 65. Marmontel, *Oeuvres Complètes*, vol. 8, pp. 125–6.
 66. *Journal Encyclopédique*, November 1765, p. 106.
 67. 'I want one to see in his action the character of the starving, and in his entire body the effects of his suffering. He does not even wait for the woman to come near him; he precipitates himself toward her, such that his extended chain pulls back his arms'. Denis Diderot, *Salons*, ed. Jean Selznec and Jean Adhémar, 4 vols (1765; 2nd edn, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1979), vol. 2, p. 95.
 68. Diderot, *Salons*, ed. Selznec and Adhémar, vol. 2, p. 95.
 69. 'The artist had her torment herself and despair, her head came out round and black-ish, a form and a color which, together with an aquiline or straight nose, give her the bizarre physiognomy of the child of a Mexican woman who slept with a European, and in which the traits of the two nations have been mixed'. Diderot, *Salons*, ed. Selznec and Adhémar, vol. 2, p. 105.
 70. Diderot, *Salons*, ed. Selznec and Adhémar, vol. 2, p. 105.
 71. Rosenblum, 'Caritas Romana after 1760'.
 72. 'The first duty of a mother is to breastfeed her children'. Diderot and D'Alembert, *Encyclopédie*, vol. 10, s.v. 'Mère'. 'She [the woman] is not worthy of the rank she occupies, unless she has employed the ornament of her charms to augment its force, by giving [society] strong and healthy citizens, who have received from her, together with her milk, an example of absolute attachment to the sacred duties which it imposes'. Roussel, *Système physique et morale de la femme* (Paris, 1775), p. 372.
 73. Sussman, *Selling Mother's Milk*, pp. 21–2.
 74. Sussman, *Selling Mother's Milk*, p. 31; Jacobus, 'Incorruptible Milk', p. 222.
 75. Baxmann, *Feste der Französischen Revolution*, p. 81.
 76. Schiebinger, *Nature's Body*, p. 71.
 77. Baxmann, *Feste der Französischen Revolution*, p. 71; Jacobus, 'Incorruptible Milk', p. 223.
 78. On Lacanian interpretations of Kleist's novellas, see Helga Gallas, 'Kleists "Penthesilea" und Lacans vier Diskurse', in Albrecht Schöne, Inge Stephan and Carl Pietzcker (eds), *Kontroversen, alte und neue*, vol. 6, *Frauensprache-Frauenliteratur? Für und wider einer Psychoanalyse literarischer Werke* (Tübingen: Niemeyer, 1986), pp. 203–12.
 79. Heinrich von Kleist, 'Das Erdbeben in Chile', in *Werke in einem Band* (1966; Munich: Carl Hanser, 1982), pp. 687–99. On Kleist's reception of Marmontel, see Gisela Schlüter, 'Kleist and Marmontel: Nochmals zu Kleist und Frankreich', *Arcadia* 24 (1989), pp. 13–24.
 80. On Chateaubriand's reception of Marmontel, see Rebecca M. Valette, 'Chateaubriand's Debt to Les Incas', *Studies in Romanticism* 2 (1963), pp. 177–83. See also Ban Wang, 'Inscribed Wilderness in Chateaubriand's Atala', *Romance Notes* 33 (1993), pp. 279–87.

81. David Wakefield, 'Chateaubriand's "Atala" as a Source of Inspiration in Nineteenth-Century Art', *Burlington Magazine* 120, no. 898 (1978), pp. 13–24; John F. Moffitt, 'The Native American "Sauvage" as Pictured by French Romantic Artists and Writers', *Gazette des Beaux Arts* 134 (1999), pp. 117–30.
82. Susan Jean Delaney, 'Representations of Chateaubriand's *Atala* in the Fine Arts and in the Popular Arts', (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Wisconsin-Madison, 1979), pp. 113–24.
83. François-René Chateaubriand, *Atala*, ed. Walter Cobb (1801; New York: New American Library, 1962), pp. 88–9.
84. Chateaubriand, *Atala*, ed. Cobb, pp. 88–9.
85. In contrast to Claudia Moscoviti, I think of Chateaubriand's treatment of cultural hybridity as rather catastrophic; Moscoviti, 'Hybridity and Ethics in Chateaubriand's *Atala*', *Nineteenth Century French Studies* 29 3/4 (2001), pp. 197–216.
86. 'A young mother, incapable of breastfeeding her child, lets it be raised by a goat. The regret that she feels gives her traits a sweet, melancholic expression'. Landon, *Annales*, vol. 9, p. 147.
87. On the mother's depression, see Margaret Fields Denton, 'A Woman's Place: The Gendering of Genres in Post-Revolutionary French Painting', *Art History* 21 (1998), pp. 219–47. In eighteenth-century founding homes in London, babies were fed animal milk. Fildes, *Wet Nursing*, pp. 158–89. Scientists like Greisel and Voltelen argued that the main ingredients of human and animal milk were identical: 'The [basic] matter of every milk is the same . . . All of them consist of butyrum, caseum, and serum . . . They differ not so much across species, as between different representatives of the same species'. Voltelen, *De Lacte Humano*, p. 65. 'You infer, thus . . . that one does not feed the young with milk of a different species. One may answer, can this be negated? It can, because, despite the various accidents that are caused by one [type of milk] or the other, it does not follow, that the same effect would occur in all [subjects]'. Greisel, *Tractatus medicus*, p. 194.
88. Maximus, *Memorable Doings and Sayings*, pp. 501–3.
89. Later artists would experiment with integrating the child as well. See e.g., Charles Lemire the Elder, *Roman Charity*, of which there is an engraving by Charles Landon, *Salon de 1812*; Gioacchino Serangeli, *Roman Charity*, 1824; Rosenblum, 'Caritas Romana after 1760', pp. 51, 53.
90. 'The young woman looks with compassion at her child, but does not cease, despite its cries, to press her mother against her breast, determined to give her the only nourishment that she can offer her. The mother, looking at her daughter with tenderness, indicates to her, with a weak hand gesture, the innocent victim of her decision; she does not want to receive assistance any longer that her filial piety takes away from motherly duties'. *Mercure de France*, Frimaire, An X (1800), p. 359.
91. 'Next to this scene a woman fulfills the most pious of duties. She nourishes her mother with her milk, but at the same time she regards her child with pain and tenderness, and seems to regret to deprive it of part of the substance that is his. To the side of the group, an old man, half naked, seems to have forgotten his own misery in admiring the generous deed of the woman'. Charles Landon, *Annales du musée et de l'école moderne des beaux-arts*, 21 vols (Paris, 1801–15), vol. 8, p. 74.
92. Hunt, *Family Romance*.
93. Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*.
94. On miscegenation as part of imperial politics, see Ann Laura Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power: Race and the Intimate in Colonial Rule* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002).
95. Chactas, *Atala*'s lover, experiences numerous fantasies of regression – some of them androgynous – centring on breastfeeding. 'Man leaves your womb [the women's] to cling to your breast and to your lips'. Chateaubriand, *Atala*, p. 23. 'Of a sudden I had regressed to a kind of childishness', p. 28. 'Seated under this tree, holding my beloved in my lap . . . I was happier than the newlywed who feels for the first time her babe stirring within her womb. . . . Suddenly I felt *Atala*'s tear trickle on my breast', p. 46. On indigenous mothers' love of their infants, see La Vega, *Royal Commentaries*, p. 111.
96. Bianca Premo, *Children of the Father King: Youth, Authority, and Legal Minority in Colonial Lima* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2005); Vaughan, *Creating the Creole Island*; Nancy Rose Hunt, "'Le Bébé en Brousse": European Women, African Birth Spacing and Colonial Intervention in Breast Feeding in the Belgian Congo', *International Journal of African Historical Studies* 21 (1988), pp. 401–32; Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge*.
97. Susan Buck-Morss, *Hegel, Haiti, and Universal History* (Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2009).
98. Jennifer L. Morgan, *Laboring Women: Reproduction and Gender in New World Slavery* (Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), pp. 27–31.

Copyright of Gender & History is the property of Wiley-Blackwell and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.